

Support, resistance and pragmatism:

An examination of motivation in language policy in Kharkiv, Ukraine

Margrethe B. Søvik



Stockholm University

Contents

1	Introduction.....	13
1.1	The context of the study	14
1.2	Central concepts, aims and research questions.....	17
1.3	Methods and material	23
1.3.1	The role of the researcher	24
1.3.2	The issue of language: Terms, definitions, concepts and ... simply words?	26
1.3.3	A note on historiography	28
1.3.4	Working assumptions and research design.....	29
1.3.5	Combining quantitative and qualitative methods: How and when it was done	33
1.3.6	Examining attitudes	35
1.3.7	Questions asked – and not asked	38
1.4	Outline of dissertation	40
2	Theoretical and analytical framework: Change, conflict and motivation.....	41
2.1	Change and conflict.....	41
2.1.1	Culture and conflict	43
2.2	Language policy, state- and nation-building	44
2.2.1	What is language policy and language planning?.....	44
2.2.2	Language regulations.....	47
2.2.3	Nation-building and the position of language	48
2.3	Languages in contact: A perspective of “holistic bilingualism” or conflict? ..	49
2.3.1	Managing multilingualism – managing conflict?	51
2.3.2	Language conflict as a proxy for other conflicts	52
2.4	Motivation as an analytical framework	54
2.4.1	Why study motivation?.....	55
2.4.2	Identity and image	57
2.4.3	Ideology.....	61
2.4.4	Insecurity	66
2.4.5	Inequality.....	68
2.4.6	Integration and instrumentality.....	71
2.5	Summary	76
3	The language issue in Ukraine: A background to the current discussion.....	79
3.1	Two grand narratives.....	79

3.1.1	“Little Russians” in the Empire	84
3.1.2	Becoming Ukrainian.....	86
3.1.3	Attempting to establish the one and unifying language.....	87
3.2	The Soviet period	90
3.2.1	1920s - Ukrainianisation.....	92
3.2.2	The battle of two cultures	93
3.2.3	1930s – Strengthening the Russian language	95
3.2.4	Changes in Soviet language policies	97
3.2.5	The concepts of bilingualism and equal rights in the USSR	100
3.2.6	The Soviet legacy	102
3.3	The post-Soviet period	103
3.3.1	The 1996 Constitution, projects for new language law and related legislation	105
3.3.2	The educational sphere: Ukrainianisation revisited?	111
3.3.3	Language in media and advertisements.....	112
3.4	The Ukrainian case: Conceiving of language as source of unity or conflict?.....	113
3.4.1	Language debates in contemporary Ukraine: A brief overview	114
3.5	Concluding remarks	120
4	Introducing the site: Kharkiv, the border area.....	122
4.1	Kharkiv.....	122
4.1.1	The Kharkiv language situation.....	125
4.1.2	Russification or Ukrainianisation: a polarised language debate	128
4.2	Kharkiv as the link between east and west.....	135
4.3	Cultural hierarchies in the borderland	140
4.3.1	A common culture divided by new boundaries	142
4.3.2	Disputing the existence of Ukrainian popular culture	143
4.4	Language, culture and history: Two versions of continuity	147
4.4.1	The generational issue and the role of the educational system.....	149
5	Attitudes to regulations and language practices in public domains.....	155
5.1	Language regulations	155
5.1.1	One or two state languages?.....	156
5.1.2	Language policies and attitudes towards support	163
5.2	Perceptions of language use in Kharkiv, past and future.....	169
5.3	Perceptions of language use in official domains in Kharkiv	171
5.3.1	Language use in government services and in education.....	172
5.3.2	Language use in the cultural sphere and mass media	174
5.3.3	Media consumption and varying language practices	177
5.3.4	Language and the workplace.....	180
5.4	Conclusion.....	183
6	Language management between duty and coercion.....	185
6.1	Incentives: Enhancing utility.....	185
6.1.1	Language and mobility	187

6.1.2	Economic and non-economic utility	189
6.2	Career moves and the economic aspect	192
6.3	Do the right thing: The notion of duty and language practices	195
6.3.1	Ideals and practicalities	198
6.3.2	Discrepancy in attitudes towards <i>knowing</i> and <i>using</i>	201
6.4	Using the “stick”: Discussing the issue of coercion	204
6.5	Conclusion.....	208
7	Discussing bilingualism and equal rights.....	210
7.1	On being reasonable	211
7.1.1	Arguing for equal rights or special rights?	214
7.1.2	The issue of <i>Russification</i>	217
7.2	Fear of cultural loss as generating resistance	220
7.2.1	Using both legs: The place of Russian language and culture	221
7.2.2	Russian language as a higher value: The problem of the intelligentsia	222
7.3	Discussing resistance or compliance	226
7.3.1	The fear of appearing ridiculous.....	230
7.4	Conclusion.....	233
8	Language-related stereotypes, norms and accommodation	235
8.1	Language-related stereotypes	236
8.1.1	Denying legitimacy and authority	239
8.2	Accommodation – a question of confidence and determination.....	243
8.2.1	The Russian language as the norm	244
8.2.2	The other side to the story: Encouraging language retention	251
8.2.3	Defining ingroups and outgroups	252
8.3	Language practices: The role of context.....	255
8.3.1	The emotional language	255
8.3.2	Uneducated language.....	258
8.3.3	The opportunistic language	258
8.4	Conclusion.....	261
9	<i>Who is Ukrainian?</i> Searching for authenticity	263
9.1	“In praise of the beloved language”: Producing an image of state and nation	263
9.1.1	The new state on the block: Respect, reputation and recognition.....	264
9.1.2	The uniqueness of the Ukrainian nation: “Be distinct!”	270
9.2	The nation and its language.....	274
9.2.1	What you talk or what you do?.....	278
9.2.2	The physical appearance of Ukraine	284
9.3	Mixed identities: On learning who you are	285
9.3.1	Language practices and personal identities	290
9.4	Conclusion.....	292

10 Concluding remarks	295
10.1 The dual context of the national and the local	299
10.2 Ideals and practicalities – what could be considered reasonable?	301
10.3 Discussing support and resistance	302
10.4 The generational dimension	305
10.5 General implications	306
References	308
Appendix A	324
Appendix B	340

List of figures, tables and illustrations

Figure 1.1 Basic assumption	20
Figure 2.1 Extended overview	77
Figure 5.1 Preferences in status and use	157
Figure 5.2 Independence versus commonality	167
Figure 5.3 One or two state languages: the historical factor	168
Figure 5.4 Perceptions of use of Russian and Ukrainian compared to 15 years ago	169
Figure 5.5 Expectations on the extent of use of Russian and Ukrainian in 20 years	170
Figure 5.6 Perceived language use in government service institutions	172
Figure 5.7 Perceptions of language use in educational spheres	173
Figure 5.8 Perceptions of language use in culture and mass media	174
Figure 8.1 Reported language use in Russian-speaking and Ukrainian-speaking surroundings	249
Table 5.1 Russian as state language due to its level of development	162
Table 5.2 Statements on language regulations and language support	164
Table 5.3 Stated language preferences in media consumption	179
Table 5.4 Reported language use at work	181
Table 5.5. Written language at work	182
Table 6.1 Language practices and duty	201
Table 6.2 Language practices and duty	202
Table 8.1 Associations to Ukrainian and Russian languages	237
Table 8.2 Top and bottom five: Associations to Ukrainian and Russian languages	238
Table 8.3 Language-related stereotypes	253
Table 8.4 Language-related stereotypes	254
Table 9.1 Statements on link between the Ukrainain nation and language	275
Table 9.2 Statements on link between any nation and language	276
Table 9.3 Statements on link between nation and language	278
Table 9.4 What does it mean to be a Ukrainian citizen?	281
Table 9.5 What does it mean to be a Ukrainian citizen?	283

Table 9.6 Does language use matter?.....290

Table 9.7 Language as part of personality292

Illustration 4.1 Map of Ukraine, Kharkiv123

Illustration 4.2 Celebrating Kharkiv’s 350th anniversary August 2004.....124

Illustration 4.3 Arriving in Kharkiv or Khar’kov?125

Illustration 4.4 Which is the capital?125

Illustration 6.1 Outside the military academy in Kharkiv196

Illustration 8.1 Making it visible; Ukrainian and Russian on signs246

Illustration 9.1 Bud’ osoblyvym!273