Meaning in the Media

Discourse, Controversy and Debate

Alan Durant



Contents

Acknowledgements			<i>page</i> xi	
	Intro	oduction	1	
	0.1	Meaning troublespots	2	
	0.2	Approaches to meaning	5	
	0.3	Historical context for a media dispute culture	11	
	0.4	Outline of main arguments	13	
	0.5	Why meanings matter	14	
Pa	rt I	Communication failure and interpretive conflict	17	
1	Froi	n personal disagreement to meaning troublespot	19	
	1.1	Introduction	19	
	1.2	Interpretive disagreement	19	
	1.3	Informal disagreement and more public 'media' disputes	21	
	1.4	Communication and the nature of disagreement	25	
	1.5	The concept of 'meaning troublespots'	26	
	1.6	Types of interpretive dispute	29	
	1.7	The problem of interpretive gridlock	30	
	1.8	Summary	32	
2	Signs of trouble		33	
	2.1	Introduction	33	
	2.2	Three kinds of trouble	33	
	2.3	Interaction between communication categories	41	
	2.4	Usefulness of communicative distinctions	43	
	2.5	Communication and social harm	45	
	2.6	Summary	46	
3	Different kinds of meaning question		48	
	3.1	Introduction	48	
	3.2	Limits of interpretation	48	
	3.3	Meaning not a single question	50	

viii		Contents		
	3.4 3.5	Conflicting attitudes towards questions of meaning Summary	63 64	
Pa	rt II	Making sense of 'meaning'	65	
4	Mea	ning and the appeal to semantics	67	
	4.1	Introduction	67	
	4.2	Meaning not an 'open and shut' case	67	
	4.3	Meaning wonderland	69	
	4.4	Meanings of meaning	72	
	4.5	Problems with applying semantics in interpretive disputes	78	
	4.6	Summary	79	
5	Interpretive variation			
	5.1	Introduction	81	
	5.2	Should a hundred meanings blossom?	81	
	5.3	Code and inference	84	
	5.4	Creativity and risk	87	
	5.5	Boundaries of legitimate inference	89	
	5.6	Public circulation of meaning	93	
	5.7	Summary	94	
6	Time-based meaning		95	
	6.1	Introduction	95	
	6.2	Meaning in the mind	95	
	6.3	When does a meaning become a meaning?	96	
	6.4	Closure and continuing dialogue	99	
	6.5	Meaning approximation	101	
	6.6	Given time and attention	103	
	6.7	This will mean more later	107	
	6.8	Summary	108	
Pa	rt III	Verbal disputes and approaches to resolving them	111	
7	Mea	ning as a knockout competition	113	
	7.1	Introduction	113	
	7.2	Fighting over meaning	113	
	7.3	Argument culture	115	
	7.4	Need for counselling in a meaning triangle	116	
	7.5	Conflict and cooperation	120	
	7.6	Caught up in the act	122	
	7.7	Clever footwork between meanings	126	
	7.8	Summary	127	

Contents	ix
----------	----

-8	Standards of interpretation	128
	8.1 Introduction	128
	8.2 Adjudicating meanings is different from interpreting	128
	8.3 Sources of interpretive authority	129
	8.4 What creates a 'standard'?	131
	8.5 Conceptual and procedural standards	133
	8.6 Interpretive standards and legal outcomes	142
	8.7 Summary	144
Par	rt IV Analysing disputes in different fields of law	
	and regulation	145
9	Defamation: 'reasonably capable of bearing the meaning	
	attributed'	147
	9.1 Introduction	147
	9.2 Libel and the meaning of words	147
	9.3 Defamatory potential: an illustration	151
	9.4 Ordinary and extended meaning	162
	9.5 Capable of bearing the meaning attributed	168
	9.6 Defamatory meaning and common knowledge	171
	9.7 Summary	173
10	Advertising: 'not only what is said, but what is reasonably	
	implied'	174
	10.1 Introduction	174
	10.2 Commercial information and persuasion	174
	10.3 Advertising and promotional discourse	176
	10.4 How discourse represents products and services	177
	10.5 Advertising law and regulation	179
	10.6 Product and service claims	180
	10.7 Beyond product and service claims	191
	10.8 Deciding what an advert is telling you	192
	10.9 The average consumer	195
	10.10 Generalised interpretive strategies	196
	10.11 Summary	198
11	Offensiveness: 'If there is a meaning, it is doubtless	
	objectionable'	199
	11.1 Introduction	199
	11.2 Meaning and boundaries of acceptability	199
	11.3 Cause for complaint	201
	11.4 Meaning in action	213
	11.5 Interpretive variation and standards	219

X	Contents		
	11.6	Symbolic shock effects	222
	11.7	Summary	223
Par	t V C	Conclusion	225
12	Trust in interpretation		227
	12.1	Introduction	227
	12.2	Meaning and speculation	227
	12.3	Risky information	231
	12.4	Trust and suspicion	235
	12.5	Pragmatic interpretation	237
	12.6	Summary	239
References			240
Index			250