

# Contents

Acknowledgements .....	V
Contents .....	VII
Introduction.....	1

## Chapter One:

### History of modern justice: Discourses, transplantation, and irritation.....

1. History of legal change from without: Iran.....	7
1.1 Law versus arbitrary will.....	7
1.2 Centralization of judicial power: Limiting the judicial competence of Islamic jurists .....	7
1.2.1 Early penal regulations .....	8
1.2.1.1 The legal structure : Crimes and punishments .....	8
1.3 Centralization of punishment and the unification of criminal sentences.....	9
1.4 The division of judicial/penal competence.....	9
1.5 Intellectual environment of legal/judicial reforms in the Late 19 <sup>th</sup> and early 20 <sup>th</sup> Century .....	10
1.5.1 Islam and Western values: Harmony or contradiction .....	11
1.5.1.1 Flexible Islam and reducible values of the Enlightenment .....	11
1.5.1.2 Rigid Islam and irreducible values of the Enlightenment .....	12
1.5.1.3 Necessity of change and continuity of legal/penal modernism.....	12
1.5.2 Debates over judicial authority: Who is a just judge? Confusion over judicial competence, disparity of sentence, and international pressures .....	13
1.6 The Constitutional Revolution .....	17
1.6.1 Debates over legislative authority: Who is a legislator? .....	18
1.6.1.1 Secular law versus divine Shari'a.....	18
1.6.1.2 Equality before the law: A challenge for Shari'a .....	18
1.6.1.3 Intermediation between divine and secular: Birth of Supervisor Ulama .....	19
1.6.1.4 Shari'a punishments and political dissidents .....	20

1.6.2	<i>Shari'a on suspension: Path towards thorough legal modernization</i> .....	22
1.6.2.1	Progressive Ulama and the triumph of law .....	22
1.6.2.2	Towards comprehensive modernization with an iron fist (the first Pahlavi) .....	23
1.6.3	<i>Modernization during the second Pahlavi</i> .....	25
1.6.3.1	Law and justice on the road of modernization .....	26
1.6.3.1.1	Modern legal education and judicial training .....	27
1.6.3.1.2	Judicial independence and the budget of the ministry of justice .....	28
1.6.4	<i>Penal modernization</i> .....	28
1.6.4.1	Iranian Penal Codes: Borrowed civilization .....	28
1.6.4.2	The structure of the Penal Codes after the Constitutional Revolution .....	29
1.6.4.3	Relationship between Shari'a and state law .....	30
1.6.4.4	Penal Code of 1926 .....	31
1.6.4.5	Some general rules of the Penal Code of 1926 .....	32
1.6.4.5.1	Principle of legality .....	32
1.6.4.5.2	Penal responsibility .....	32
1.6.4.5.3	Categories of crime and types of punishment .....	32
1.6.4.5.4	Collateral punishment .....	33
1.6.4.5.5	Suspension of punishment .....	33
1.6.4.5.6	Capital punishment .....	33
1.6.4.5.7	Royal amnesty .....	34
1.6.4.6	Coexistence of Shari'a and state law in penal justice .....	34
1.6.4.7	Penal Code of 1974 .....	34
1.6.4.8	Rehabilitative ideal and correctional purposes of punishment .....	35
1.6.4.9	Role of the victim in the criminal process .....	36
1.6.4.10	Amnesty .....	37
1.6.4.11	Juvenile courts and punishments .....	37
2.	<b>History of punishment in Germany: Penal evolution from within</b> .....	38
2.1	Early Criminal Codes .....	38
2.1.1	<i>Constitutio Criminalis Carolina</i> .....	38
2.1.2	<i>Criminal Code of 1871</i> .....	38
2.1.3	<i>Retributive justice versus utilitarian justice</i> .....	39
2.1.4	<i>Symbiosis of retribution and rehabilitation: Double-track system of punishment</i> .....	41
3.	<b>Synthesizing changes from within and without: Modernity of tradition and tradition of modernity</b> .....	42

## Chapter Two:

### **Criminal punishment in context: Islamic Republic of Iran and Federal Republic of Germany compared**

<b>1. Reappearance of Islamic Shari'a: Rise of state penal Shari'a</b>	<b>45</b>
1.1 Islam: A critical tool against modern discipline	45
1.2 Rise of Islam as an alternative regime of governance	49
1.3 Islamic Republic: From republic of spirituality and fidelity to Shari'a and obedience	49
<b>2. Penal ideology and penal practice in the Islamic Republic of Iran</b>	<b>50</b>
2.1 Redefining penal discourse, institutions, and practices	50
2.2 Punishment and prison in view of the founders of the Islamic Republic	50
2.3 Structural context of criminal justice: Challenges, debates and changes	53
2.3.1 <i>Nature of the political regime and constitution</i>	53
2.3.2 <i>Reintroduction of Shari'a in public policy and law</i>	54
2.3.2.1 Restoring the traditional judicial authority	55
2.3.2.2 Reformation of penal authority and law	55
2.3.3 <i>Reformulation of crimes and punishments</i>	55
2.3.4 <i>Interplay of Shari'a, criminal law, and liberty in post-revolutionary constitution</i>	56
2.3.4.1 Shari'a and (criminal) law: Competition, accordance, negation, and conflict	56
2.3.4.2 Rule of Islamic jurists versus the rule of law	57
2.3.4.3 Reorganization of the justice system	58
2.3.4.4 Shari'a and liberty	59
2.3.4.5 Retaining the overall competence over judicial cases	59
2.3.4.6 Two legal training and plural judicial decisions	61
2.3.5 <i>Modernizing Shari'a: Clerical challenge and Taazir controversy</i>	62
2.3.6 <i>Centralization of Shari'a</i>	65
2.3.7 <i>Mujtahid versus the law: The challenge of judicial revision</i>	66
2.3.7.1 Law of criminal procedure: Story of the ever-changing law	67
<b>3. Sentencing Laws, options and standards</b>	<b>69</b>
3.1 Regulatory framework of sentencing in Iran	69
3.1.1 <i>Remodeling penal control policies</i>	69
3.1.1.1 General rules of the Islamic Penal Code	70
3.1.1.1.1 The principle of legality	71
3.1.1.1.2 Juvenile criminal justice	73
3.2 Criminal sentences in Iran	75
3.2.1 <i>The Act of Hudud and Qisas</i>	75
3.2.2 <i>Sacred rituals of the death penalty</i>	75

3.2.2.1	Laws of retaliation .....	75
3.2.2.2	Retaliation and categories of victim: religion, gender and parental authority .....	76
3.2.2.2.1	Religion and retaliation .....	76
3.2.2.2.2	Gender and retaliation .....	76
3.2.2.2.3	Parental authority and retaliation .....	77
3.2.2.2.4	Victim's crime and retaliation .....	77
3.2.2.2.5	Evidentiary rules of Qisas .....	77
3.2.2.2.6	Co-oath: An archaic evidential method.....	77
3.2.2.2.7	Rules of administering Qisas.....	78
3.2.2.2.8	Retaliation beyond the original crime .....	78
3.2.2.2.9	Weather and retaliation .....	79
3.2.3	<i>Diya: Deal over the revengeful feelings of the victim</i> .....	79
3.2.3.1	Types of Diya .....	79
3.2.3.2	Less valuable life: Diya of Muslim and non-Muslim .....	79
3.2.4	<i>Death Penalty as a Hadd punishment</i> .....	81
3.2.4.1	Evidentiary rules of Hadd death penalty.....	82
3.2.4.1	Crimes punished by Hadd death penalty .....	82
3.2.4.2.1	Fornication.....	82
3.2.4.2.2	Death punishment for deviant sexual identities .....	82
3.2.4.2.3	Muhariba: Waging war against God, his prophet, and the Islamic state .....	83
3.2.4.2.4	Types of punishment of Muharib.....	83
3.2.4.2.5	Evidentiary rules of Muhariba .....	84
3.2.4.2.6	Repentance and punishment of Muhariba.....	84
3.2.4.2.7	Extension of the scope of enemies of God and the Islamic state .....	84
3.2.5	<i>Taazir punishments: The free penal zone of the Islamic state</i> .....	86
3.2.5.1	Taazirat crimes and punishments .....	86
3.2.5.2	Bazdarandeh punishments.....	87
3.2.6	<i>The Regulations of administering capital punishment</i> .....	88
3.2.6.1	Early regulatory laws of administering the capital punishment and their historical development .....	88
3.2.6.2	Administration of Qisas and other death penalties: Post-revolutionary Iran .....	89
3.2.6.2.1	Presence of the public at the place of execution.....	89
3.2.6.2.2	The last religious prayer .....	90
3.2.6.2.3	Killing methods.....	90
3.2.6.3	Death penalty as Taazir.....	90
3.2.7	<i>Death penalty in practice</i> .....	91

3.2.7.1	Death sentences and executions from 2002 to 2006 .....	91
3.2.7.1.1	Sex of the executed .....	94
3.2.7.1.2	Age of the executed.....	95
3.2.7.1.3	Capital punishment of juvenile offenders .....	96
3.2.7.1.4	Method of the execution in practice.....	96
3.2.8	<i>Public penal scaffolds: A device to preserve the internal security and to confront international (Western) sensitivity</i> .....	97
3.2.9	<i>Qisas: A life for a life</i> .....	99
3.2.10	<i>Drug dealers: Dealers of death</i> .....	99
3.2.11	<i>History of prison and imprisonment in Iran</i> .....	100
3.2.11.1	First prisons in Iran: Qajar dynasty .....	100
3.2.11.2	Modernizing prisons .....	101
3.2.11.2.1	Judicial supervision of prisons.....	101
3.2.11.2.2	Classification of prisoners .....	101
3.2.11.2.3	First panoptical prison in Iran .....	101
3.2.11.2.4	Work in prison .....	102
3.2.11.2.5	Ideal of rehabilitation and reform in prisons.....	103
3.2.11.2.6	Work in the prison in practice.....	103
3.2.11.3	Transplanted penal institutions, resistances, and continuity of discontinuities.....	104
3.2.12	<i>Imprisonment in post-revolutionary Iran</i> .....	105
3.2.12.1	Security prisoners: Arbitrary confinement.....	106
3.2.12.2	Prison regulations and instructions.....	107
3.2.12.3	Prison directives: A history of non-applied regulations .....	107
3.2.12.3.1	Prison regimes and categorization of prisoners.....	107
3.2.12.3.2	Daily program of the prisoners in prison .....	109
3.2.12.3.3	Disciplining the prisoners .....	110
3.2.12.4	Prison in practice .....	112
3.2.12.4.1	Overcrowded prisons: Overcriminalization or the lack of non-custodial sanctions or insufficient prisons.....	112
3.2.12.4.2	Public donation: a mechanism for reduction of default prisoners .....	116
3.2.12.5	Whipping.....	117
3.2.12.5.1	Whipping: Pre-revolutionary Iran .....	117
3.2.12.5.2	Whipping: Post-revolutionary Iran.....	177
3.2.12.5.3	Administration of whipping.....	118
3.2.12.5.4	Whipping in Taazirat Act .....	119
3.2.12.6	Suspension of the sentence .....	119
3.12.2.7	Suspension of the punishment in practice.....	121

3.2.12.8	Conditional release .....	121
3.2.12.9	Amnesty as a sovereign method for reducing the penal population.....	122
3.2.12.10	Amnesty in practice .....	125
3.3	Judicial penal choices and the discretionary power of penal judges in Iran .....	126
3.3.1	<i>Pre-revolutionary Iran</i> .....	126
3.3.2	<i>Post revolutionary Iran</i> .....	128
<b>4.</b>	<b>Sentencing in Germany</b> .....	130
4.1	Guilt as a normative framework of sentencing decision.....	130
4.2	Preventive consideration in criminal sentencing: Criminal risk and danger.....	130
4.3	Imprisonment versus custody in preventive detention: The double track system of sanctioning .....	131
4.4	Guilt, rehabilitation, and prevention: Triad justification of criminal sanctions .....	132
4.5	Types of criminal sentences in Germany .....	132
4.5.1	<i>Imprisonment</i> .....	133
4.5.1.1	Prison in Germany: History, philosophy, and goals .....	133
4.5.1.2	Enforcement and continuous debates on the main goals of imprisonment .....	135
4.5.1.2.1	Retribution (guilt) versus rehabili- tation .....	135
4.5.1.2.2	Exclusion (incapacitation) versus rehabilitation .....	136
4.5.1.2.3	The function of work in prison .....	137
4.5.1.3	Public attitudes towards rehabilitation and their impact on the legislature .....	138
4.5.2	<i>Life imprisonment</i> .....	142
4.5.2.1	Life imprisonment and human dignity .....	142
4.5.3	<i>Preventive detention</i> .....	144
4.5.3.1	Forms of preventive detention.....	145
4.5.3.2	Historical development of preventive detention .....	145
4.5.3.3	Preventive detention in practice .....	147
4.5.3.4	Judicial discussions on preventive detention: Constitutional rights and preventive detention.....	147
4.5.3.5	Preventive detention: Treatment for rehabili- tation or combating of enemies? .....	148
4.5.4	<i>Psychiatric institutions</i> .....	149
4.5.5	<i>Fines</i> .....	150
4.6	Suspension of criminal sentences .....	150
4.7	Amnesty laws in Germany: Residual of sovereign authority.....	151
4.8	Criminal sentences in practice in Germany.....	153
4.8.1	<i>The most prevailing criminal sentence</i> .....	153
4.8.2	<i>The least prevailing criminal sentence</i> .....	154
4.8.3	<i>Increase of indeterminate detention</i> .....	155

<b>5. Comparative perspectives and considerations .....</b>	<b>156</b>
5.1 Legislative penal choices .....	156
5.2 The history of the death penalty in Germany .....	158
5.2.1 <i>Historical development</i> .....	158
5.2.2 <i>Public attitudes to capital punishment</i> .....	160
5.2.3 <i>Views of students on forms of punishment</i> .....	161
5.2.3.1 Death penalty .....	161
5.2.3.2 Life imprisonment .....	161
5.3 Just constraints on punishing power in Germany .....	162
5.4 Judicial knowledge: Iran and Germany .....	165
5.5 Human rights and criminal punishment in Germany (West) .....	167
5.6 Punishment and Western sensitives: The challenge of human rights ...	170
5.7 Human rights discourse in pre-revolutionary Iran .....	171
5.8 Criminal punishment: Clash of governing through Islam and governing through human rights .....	172
5.9 Punishment and human rights in Iran .....	173
5.9.1 <i>Their human rights and our human rights</i> .....	174
5.9.2 <i>The challenges between "their" human rights and "our"</i> <i>practices</i> .....	175
5.10 Challenging Islamic punishments: Human rights norms or public awareness .....	177
5.11 Punishment and crime victims .....	178
5.11.1 <i>Collective representation of individual victims</i> .....	178
5.11.2 <i>Iran</i> .....	180
5.11.2.1 Plural representation of victims .....	180
5.11.2.2 The revolutionary transformation of public claims to private claims and private to public .....	180
5.11.2.3 Iran and Germany .....	185
5.12 Concluding remarks .....	186
5.12.1 <i>Rule of political interests versus rule of legal norms</i> .....	186
5.12.2 <i>Rule of political law</i> .....	186
5.12.3 <i>Normative plurality</i> .....	188
5.12.4 <i>The demise of consensus over Shari'a penal laws</i> .....	189
5.12.5 <i>The meaning of punishment</i> .....	190

### Chapter Three:

<b>Public attitudes to crime punishment and Sharia in Iran .....</b>	<b>199</b>
--	------------

<b>1. Evolution of Punishment in Islamic Countries .....</b>	<b>199</b>
<b>2. Hypotheses of the Survey .....</b>	<b>201</b>
<b>3. Sampling and administration of the questionnaire .....</b>	<b>202</b>
3.1 Students and Tulab .....	203
3.2 Justice Officials .....	204
<b>4. Socio-demographic composition of respondents .....</b>	<b>204</b>
4.1 Gender .....	204
4.2 Age .....	204

4.3	Profession.....	205
4.4	Place of Residence .....	205
<b>5.</b>	<b>Findings of the survey .....</b>	<b>206</b>
5.1	Attitudes to effective ways of crime prevention .....	206
5.2	Preferred punishment for specific crimes across genders and professions .....	207
5.2.1	<i>Gender and attitudes to suitable punishment for rape and homosexuality.....</i>	<i>208</i>
5.2.1.1	Rape.....	208
5.2.1.2	Homosexuality.....	209
5.2.2	<i>Gender and preferred punishment for murder, theft, improper Hijab, and attitudes to impunity of honor killing ....</i>	<i>210</i>
5.2.3	<i>Profession and preferred punishment for murder, theft, improper Hijab, and attitudes to impunity of honor killing ....</i>	<i>212</i>
5.3	Attitudes to the death penalty .....	212
5.3.1	<i>Gender and the death penalty.....</i>	<i>212</i>
5.3.2	<i>Profession and attitudes to the death penalty.....</i>	<i>213</i>
5.3.3	<i>Place of residence and attitudes to the death penalty .....</i>	<i>214</i>
5.4	Attitudes to corporal punishment.....	214
5.4.1	<i>Gender and attitudes to corporal punishment .....</i>	<i>214</i>
5.4.2	<i>Profession and attitudes to corporal punishment.....</i>	<i>215</i>
5.5	Attitudes to prison and imprisonment.....	216
5.6	Attitudes to the purposes of punishment.....	218
5.7	Criminal law and Shari'a .....	219
5.8	Effect of independent variables on respondents' attitudes .....	222
5.9	Latent analytical variables .....	223
5.9.1	<i>Progressive and dogmatic attitudes .....</i>	<i>224</i>
5.9.2	<i>The death penalty and views of Shari'a .....</i>	<i>225</i>
5.9.3	<i>Corporal punishment and views of Shari'a.....</i>	<i>226</i>
5.9.4	<i>Retaliatory death penalty and perceptions of Shari'a.....</i>	<i>227</i>
5.9.5	<i>Punishment of theft and views of Shari'a .....</i>	<i>227</i>
5.9.6	<i>Punishment of rape and views of Shari'a.....</i>	<i>228</i>
5.9.7	<i>Penal reform and perceptions of Shari'a .....</i>	<i>229</i>
5.9.8	<i>Punitive attitudes and perceptions of Shari'a .....</i>	<i>230</i>
5.9.9	<i>Views to separation of penal legislation and Islamic Shari'a .....</i>	<i>231</i>
5.9.10	<i>Goals of punishment and perception of Shari'a.....</i>	<i>232</i>
5.10	Discussion.....	234
<b>6.</b>	<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>235</b>

## Chapter Four:

<b>Concluding Remarks of the Study.....</b>	<b>237</b>
---	------------

<b>1. Understanding the differences and contrasts between Iran and Germany.....</b>	<b>237</b>
<b>2. Multi-factorial analysis of differences in sentencing law and practices..</b>	<b>241</b>



2.1 Consensual Normative Framework of Sentencing .....241

2.2 Criminal punishment and institutionalized struggle over  
legitimate authority .....242

2.3 Sentencing policies and practices: Patterns of decision-making .....244

2.4 Penal reform: Ideals, challenges and methods .....246

  

Bibliography .....249

List of Tables .....263

List of Figures .....263

List of Charts .....265

List of Graphs .....265