

CONTENTS

<i>Table of Cases</i>	page xi
<i>Table of Instruments</i>	xiv

Introduction	1
I.1 Introduction	1
I.2 Central Themes	3
I.2.1 The Best Interests Principle	3
I.2.2 Comparative Case Studies	4
I.2.3 Social Reality	6
I.3 Terminology	7
I.4 Chapter Structure	10
1 The Best Interests Principle: Theoretical Understanding	14
1.1 Introduction	14
1.2 Foundational Development of the UNCRC	17
1.3 Widespread Acceptance	21
1.4 Criticisms of the Best Interests Principle	24
1.4.1 Indeterminacy	24
1.4.2 'Smokescreen' Argument	29
1.4.3 Paternalism and Rights-Based Determinations	32
1.5 A Conceptual Framework for the Best Interests Principle	37

1.6	Domestic Application of the Best Interests Principle	38
1.6.1	England and Wales: The Welfare Principle	38
1.6.2	Ireland: The Best Interests Principle	44
1.6.3	South Africa: The Best Interests Principle	48
1.7	Conclusion	56
2	The Best Interests of the Child: Sociological and Psychological Research	58
2.1	Introduction	58
2.2	Applying Social Science Research in Child Law	61
2.3	Are Married Opposite-Sex Parents the 'Ideal'?	63
2.4	Outcomes for Children Raised by Gay and Lesbian Parents	68
2.5	Conclusion	76
3	Parental Responsibility	78
3.1	Introduction	78
3.2	What Is Parental Responsibility?	79
3.2.1	Language and Terminology	79
3.2.2	Parental Responsibility in England and Wales	82
3.2.3	Guardianship in Ireland	84
3.2.4	Parental Responsibilities and Rights in South Africa	85
3.2.5	Reflections on Terminology and Definitions	87
3.3	The Exercise of Parental Responsibility	88
3.3.1	England and Wales	88
3.3.2	Ireland	90
3.3.3	South Africa	95
3.4	Extending Parental Responsibility for Status and Security	97
3.4.1	Known Fathers and Parental Responsibility	99
3.4.2	Social Parents and Parental Responsibility	104
3.5	Conclusion	112

4	Adoption	114
4.1	Introduction	114
4.2	Adoption as a Means of Securing Existing Family Relationships	115
4.2.1	The Appropriateness of Second-Parent Adoption	116
4.2.2	The Appropriateness of Second-Parent Adoption in the Context of Intercountry Adoptions	119
4.3	Domestic Adoption	121
4.3.1	England and Wales	122
4.3.2	Ireland	127
4.3.3	South Africa	131
4.3.4	Summary of Comparative Jurisdictions	136
4.4	Approach of the ECtHR	136
4.4.1	Adoption and Marriage	137
4.4.2	<i>Gas and Dubois v. France</i>	139
4.4.3	<i>X and Others v. Austria</i>	143
4.5	Conclusion	145
5	Donor Conception	147
5.1	Introduction	147
5.2	The Legal Framework for Donor Conception in England and Wales, Ireland and South Africa	149
5.2.1	England and Wales: Human Fertilisation and Embryology Acts 1990 and 2008	149
5.2.2	Ireland: Children and Family Relationships Act 2015	152
5.2.3	South Africa: Children's Act 2005	163
5.3	Donor Conception and the Best Interests of the Child	166
5.3.1	The Child's Right to Identity	166
5.3.2	Safeguarding the Right to Identity	168
5.3.3	Identity and the 'Fatherless' Child	181

5.4	Should Non-clinical Procedures Be Subject to Different Rules of Parentage than Clinical Procedures?	185
5.5	Conclusion	190
6	Surrogacy	192
6.1	Introduction	192
6.2	The Regulation of Surrogacy	193
6.2.1	'[A] Surrogacy Agreement Is Degrading to the Child Who Is to Be the Outcome of It'	196
6.2.2	The 'Motherless Child'	199
6.3	The European Convention on Human Rights	204
6.4	Surrogacy in England and Wales	210
6.4.1	The Delayed Model of Parentage	214
6.5	Surrogacy in Ireland	218
6.6	Surrogacy in South Africa	224
6.7	Pre-conception Allocation of Parentage	227
6.8	International Surrogacy	232
6.9	Conclusion	234
	Conclusion	235
7.1	Introduction	235
7.2	The Way Forward: Implications of the Best Interests Principle	236
7.3	Conclusion	239
	<i>Bibliography</i>	241
	<i>Index</i>	254