

Self-Determination and Borders

The Obligation to Show Consideration for
the Interests of Others

Märta C. Johanson

ÅBO 2004

ÅBO AKADEMIS FÖRLAG – ÅBO AKADEMI UNIVERSITY PRESS

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----------|
| Abstract | 3 |
| Acknowledgements | 11 |
| Table of abbreviations | 12 |
| 1. INTRODUCTION | 13 |
| 1.1 Introductory remarks | |
| 1.2 The territorial angle | 15 |
| 1.3 The problem and delimitation of the study | 19 |
| 1.4 Method of study and theory | 21 |
| 1.5 Premises or tenets of the international system | 23 |
| 2. The PRINCIPLE of SELF-DETERMINATION | 29 |
| 2.1 Historical background | |
| 2.1.1 The principle of self-determination | |
| 2.1.1.1 Origins and development of the concept | |
| <i>i: Individual v community</i> | 32 |
| <i>ii: Empire v nation</i> | 33 |
| <i>iii: Centralism v autonomy</i> | 34 |
| <i>iv: First world war</i> | 40 |
| <i>v: Post-second world war, the UN Charter and decolonisation</i> | 44 |
| 2.2 The principle examined: values and objects | 47 |
| 2.2.1 Respect for the principle of self-determination and the maintenance of peace | |
| 2.2.1.1 Values identified when applying self-determination | |
| <i>i: Ending national oppression</i> | 48 |
| <i>ii: Ending racial oppression</i> | 50 |
| <i>iii: Post-colonial developments</i> | 51 |
| <i>iv: Some conclusions on values</i> | 52 |
| 2.2.1.2 Self-determination in boundary disputes | 53 |
| 3. Three TERRITORIAL PRINCIPLES | 59 |
| 3.1 Sticklers or not? | |
| 3.2 Territorial integrity | 60 |
| 3.2.1 Territorial integrity as territorial inviolability | 61 |
| 3.2.2 Territorial integrity as a right: external and internal dimensions | 62 |
| 3.3 <i>Uti possidetis</i> | 70 |
| 3.3.1 Latin America | 72 |
| 3.3.2 Post-first world war settlements | 84 |
| 3.3.3 Africa | 87 |
| 3.3.4 Yugoslavia | 102 |
| 3.3.4.1 Consent in relation to boundary changes and <i>uti possidetis</i> | 103 |
| 3.3.4.2 <i>Uti possidetis</i> in light of the UN Charter Purposes | 105 |
| 3.3.4.3 <i>Uti possidetis</i> as general customary international law: context ignored? | 107 |
| 3.3.4.4 'Badinter law' expanding?: The Canadian response | 112 |
| 3.4 The stability of boundaries | 116 |
| 3.4.1 The principle of the stability of boundaries | |
| 3.4.2 International stability | 121 |
| 3.5 Conclusions relating to self-determination | 123 |

| | |
|---|------------|
| 4. The LEGAL FRAMEWORK | 127 |
| 4.1 The nature of the UN Charter | |
| 4.1.1 Different types of treaty | |
| 4.1.2 Different approaches to the UN Charter | 132 |
| 4.1.2.1 Multilateral treaty | |
| 4.1.2.2 Political treaty | 133 |
| 4.1.2.3 The constitution of an international organisation | 134 |
| 4.1.2.4 The constitution of an international community | 135 |
| 4.1.3 Is there an international community? | 136 |
| 4.1.3.1 The existence of an international community | |
| 4.1.3.2 Validity and normativity in international law | 140 |
| 4.1.3.3 The role and proposed content of constitutional rules | 142 |
| 4.1.4 Moving from reciprocity and consensualism to community through the UN Charter | 146 |
| 4.1.4.1 A short overview | |
| 4.1.4.2 The constitutional character of the UN Charter | 151 |
| <i>i: Internal evidence</i> | |
| <i>ii: Links between suggested constitutional content and the UN Charter</i> | 153 |
| <i>iii: Consequences of the constitutionality of the UN Charter</i> | 154 |
| 4.1.5 The character of Purposes and Principles | 155 |
| 4.1.5.1 The Preamble, Purposes and Principles | |
| 4.1.5.2 The principle of the self-determination of peoples | 158 |
| 5. A THEORY of RECONCILIATION | 161 |
| 5.1 The requirement of systemic unity: the challenge to law | |
| 5.1.1 Collisions and responses: Priority or balancing | 162 |
| 5.1.1.1 Delimiting rules and principles | 165 |
| <i>i: The principle of self-determination</i> | 171 |
| 5.1.2 Harmonisation or reconciliation: the best of all worlds? | 172 |
| 5.2 Unity by interpretation | 173 |
| 5.2.1 General comments | |
| 5.2.2 Problems and application: The UN Charter | 175 |
| 5.2.2.1 Interpreting the UN Charter | 176 |
| <i>i: A teleological approach</i> | 179 |
| <i>ii: On the will of the parties and supplementary materials</i> | 181 |
| <i>iii: Practice as developing Charter interpretation</i> | 184 |
| 5.2.2.2 Amending by interpretation | 186 |
| 5.2.2.3 Interpreting UN Charter Purposes and Principles | 187 |
| 5.3 The values and context approach, or Baking the cake | 190 |
| 6. DIFFERENT FUNCTIONS and EFFECTS of BORDERS: | 193 |
| International and internal administrative boundaries | |
| 6.1 Studying border differences and changes: a missing component | |
| 6.1.1 The nature of borders | 194 |
| 6.1.2 Purposes, functionality and effects of borders | 196 |
| 6.1.2.1 International borders | 198 |
| 6.1.2.2 Internal borders | 202 |
| 6.2 From internal to international borders: effects and challenges | 205 |
| 6.2.1 The impact of borders | |
| 6.2.1.1 From frontiers to boundaries, and internal to international borders | 206 |
| 6.2.1.2 From location to functionality | 211 |
| 6.2.1.3 Hard and soft boundaries | 214 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 6.2.2 Border disputes: issues and responses | 217 |
| 6.2.2.1 Identifying the problems | |
| 6.2.2.2 Responses to locational and functional boundary changes and recent legal developments | 222 |
| 6.2.3 Changing internal into international borders | 232 |
| 6.2.3.1 Gaining independence within international or internal boundaries | |
| 6.2.3.2 Central Asia | 237 |
| 6.2.3.3 Yugoslavia | 241 |
| 6.2.4 Some tentative conclusions and suggestions | 245 |

7. TWO DISPARATE CASES FURTHER EXAMINED 249

7.1 Yugoslavia

| | |
|---|-----|
| 7.1.1 The creation of the state | |
| 7.1.1.1 Pre-Yugoslavia | |
| 7.1.1.2 The first Yugoslavia | 252 |
| 7.1.1.3 The second Yugoslavia | 256 |
| 7.1.2 The conflict | 265 |
| 7.1.2.1 Positions, presumptions and decisions | 267 |
| <i>i: Political values</i> | |
| <i>ii: Boundary functionality and effect</i> | 268 |
| <i>iii: The Badinter Commission</i> | 269 |
| 7.1.3 The law suggested | 270 |

7.2 Central Asia: Kyrgyzstan and Uzbekistan 271

| | |
|--|-----|
| 7.2.1 The creation of the states | |
| 7.2.1.1 Some short comments on Central Asia | 271 |
| 7.2.1.2 The creation and development of the USSR | 274 |
| <i>i: Responses to the political shift: irredentist, instinctive and ideological</i> | |
| <i>ii: Designing a strategy</i> | 280 |
| <i>iii: From vision to reality, or How it was actually done</i> | 282 |
| <i>iv: Central Asia: Kokand and after...</i> | 285 |
| <i>v: Central Asia: Creating nation-states</i> | 290 |
| <i>vi: National transformation and Russification</i> | 295 |
| <i>vii: 1991</i> | 297 |
| 7.2.2 Some conclusions | 299 |

8. APPLYING THE THEORY TO REALITY 303 **and other CONCLUSIONS**

LIST of MAPS

| | |
|--|-----|
| Map 1. South America 1799 | 75 |
| Map 2. Colonial Africa 1926-46 | 88 |
| Map 3. Africa before major colonisation 1855 | 208 |
| Map 4. Balkans 1878 | 209 |
| Map 5. Former Yugoslavia (SFRY) | 262 |
| Map 6. Middle East & Central Asia mid-1800s | 273 |
| Map 7. Central Asian delimitations 1922 | 283 |
| Map 8. Central Asia post-1991 | 298 |

| | |
|--------------------------|-----|
| Bibliography | 309 |
| Table and index of cases | 330 |
| Index | 332 |